TÍTULO: Cuadro de mando para supervisar la política lingüística y su aprobación en el ejemplo de las regiones de la Federación de Rusia.

AUTORES:
4. Dr. Marina Krekova.

RESUMEN: El artículo está dedicado a cuestiones de estado y desarrollo de la política lingüística a nivel regional. Teniendo en cuenta la estructura federal del país y el alto grado de diversidad lingüística e interétnica en las regiones de la Federación de Rusia, existen diferencias significativas en los aspectos organizativos y sustantivos de la política lingüística, los principios básicos y las direcciones formuladas a nivel federal. El artículo presenta los fundamentos metodológicos y la implementación práctica de la evaluación de actividades de las autoridades de los temas de la Federación de Rusia para preservar y apoyar los idiomas nativos de los pueblos de la Federación de Rusia.
PALABRAS CLAVES: cuadro de mando, puntaje de calificación, autoridades regionales, idioma nativo, política lingüística.

TITLE: Scorecard for monitoring language policy and its approbation on the example of the Russian Federation’s regions

AUTHORS:
4. Dr. Marina Krekova.

ABSTRACT: The article is devoted to issues of the state and development of language policy at the regional level. Taking into consideration the country’s federal structure and the high degree of linguistic and interethnic diversity in the Russian Federation’s regions, there are significant differences in the organizational and substantive aspects of the language policy, the basic principles and directions formulated at the federal level. The article presents the methodological foundations and practical implementation of the activities assessment of the authorities of the Russian Federation’ subjects in preserving and supporting the native languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation.

KEY WORDS: scorecard, rating score, regional authorities, native language, language policy.
INTRODUCTION.

The policy of the state and regions in relation to the native languages of the nations of the Russian Federation at the present stage become increasingly important, while being insufficiently presented as a scientific problem in literature and journal publications.

Among the authors, whose works are devoted to linguistic issues in a socio-managerial context, we should highlight the monographs by Belov et al. (2018); Lukianova et al. (2017); Solganik et al. (2012); Alpatov et al. (2015); Mikheeva et. al. (2013); articles by Morozova (2011); Gavrilov (2011); Grigoryev (2003); Kanevsky (2015) and a number of other authors.

In the mentioned and other sources, language policy issues are considered mainly from the general methodological point of view, the practical application and specific recommendations in the literature are practically absent.

Language policy issues abroad are also relevant, as in our country. Particularly acute is the problem of preserving indigenous languages; for example, in Indonesia (Rahmi, 2016), the region of the central Andes (Bolivia, Ecuador, Peru) (Haboud and Limerick, 2016), as well as in certain regions of European countries (Lai, 2018; Jetchev, 2019).

There is an acute question of the preservation and development of state (official) languages in many countries (Sharma, 2018) which is associated with growing migration flows and the increasing presence of the English language in all spheres of life. Questions of the dominance of certain languages in certain territories often has a historical and political context.

The effective language and educational policy and planning (LPP (Language policy and planning)) (Catherine Chua Siew Kheng, 2018; Spolsky, 2018; Sah, 2018; Souza and Javier Calvo del Olmo, 2019; Barakos and Unger, 2016; Perez-Milans, 2018) in the field of preserving and studying the languages of the nations of Russia is impossible without reliable statistics on the language situation in each region of the country (the number of pupils studying native languages and studying in their
native languages from among the languages of the nations of the Russian Federation, information on the real use of the languages of the nations of the Russian Federation in other areas of political, public and economic life, etc.). However, until recently, public authorities have not such information.

Since the year 2015, in accordance with the List of Instructions of the President of the Russian Federation following the results of the joint meeting of the Presidential Council on Interethnic Relations and the Presidential Council on the Russian Language on May 19, 2015, the Ministry of Education of the Russian Federation, together with other ministries, has been monitoring the status and development languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation.

The purpose of monitoring is to analyze the dynamics of the language situation and to develop effective mechanisms for implementing the state language policy, taking into account the constitutional status of languages from among the languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation, including the Russian language.

However, monitoring data are not publicly available. In addition, monitoring does not analyze the conditions created by regional authorities in the field of support, preservation and development of the languages of the nations of Russia.

**DEVELOPMENT.**

**Materials and methods.**

As part of the study, the authors developed the methodology for assessing the authorities of the subjects of the Russian Federation by the level of development of the regional environment, which contributes to the preservation, and study of the native languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation.
The methodology is intended primarily to assess the activities of regional authorities of the subjects of the Russian Federation with a high level of prevalence of national languages in support of the native languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation and in ensuring the possibility of receiving education in their native language.

Study’s geography is all 85 subjects of the Russian Federation (those regions in which linguistic differentiation was not recorded have been excluded from this number). Depth of calculations - 2016-2019.

During the study, the following scientific approaches and methods were used (Maltseva, and Gridchina, 2016):

1. Methods of statistical data’s results analysis.
3. Data standardization method.
4. Rating method.
5. The method of graphical presentation of ranking results.

In accordance with the assessment objectives and the methodology for collecting, processing and analyzing information about the state and development of languages of the peoples of Russia, about language and educational policies pursued by regional authorities, the rating is formed according to the following thematic clusters:

1. Tools for the implementation of state national policy in the region, including in terms of supporting, preserving and studying the native languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation.
2. Preservation and study of native languages in the field of education and science.
3. Preservation and study of native languages in the field of culture and art.
4. Preservation and study of native languages in the media.
During the study, the following quantitative indicators and qualitative characteristics were identified that allow us to assess the activities of regional authorities of the subjects of the Russian Federation according to these thematic clusters (table 1).

Table 1 - Quantitative indicators and qualitative characteristics of the activities of regional authorities of the subjects of the Russian Federation to support the native languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation and to ensure the possibility of receiving education in native language.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Thematic cluster</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>INSTRUMENTS FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION OF STATE NATIONAL POLICY IN THE REGION INCLUDING IN THE SPHERE OF LANGUAGE AND EDUCATIONAL POLICY RELATING SUPPORT, PRESERVATION AND STUDY OF THE NATIVE LANGUAGES OF THE PEOPLES OF THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION</td>
<td>Number of regional authorities responsible for the implementation of linguistic and educational policies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regional system of management and coordination of linguistic and educational policies relating to support, preservation and development of languages of the peoples of Russia.</td>
<td>Availability of the website of the administration of the subject of the Russian Federation translated into the native languages of the nations of Russia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Availability of coordination, public councils and other advisory bodies created under state bodies and local authorities responsible for the implementation of the language policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regional regulatory framework in the field of language policy</td>
<td>Level of development of the regulatory framework in the field of language policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategic documents aimed at the implementation of the language and educational policies relating the support, preservation and study of the native languages of the nations of the Russian Federation in the region</td>
<td>The number of regional strategies and concepts aimed at the preservation, study and development of the languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number of regional strategic planning documents, which subprograms and activities are aimed at implementing language policy in the region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State programs aimed at</td>
<td>Availability of ongoing state programs of the subject of the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thematic cluster</td>
<td>Indicator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>implementing language and educational policies relating to support, preservation and study of the native languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation in the region.</td>
<td>Russian Federation on the preservation and development of languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thematic cluster</td>
<td>Indicator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relative increase (decrease) in teachers of the native language and literature</td>
<td>Number of teachers of the native language and literature in 2017.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and literature in 2017 compared to 2016.</td>
<td>Number of continuing education courses for teachers of native languages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of teachers of the native language and literature in 2017.</td>
<td>Number of olympiads and competitions for schoolchildren and students in the languages of the nations of Russia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competitive events for schoolchildren and students in the languages of the</td>
<td>Number of competitive events of professional mastery in the field of teaching the native languages of the nations of the Russian Federation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>nations of Russia</td>
<td>Competitive events of professional mastery in the field of teaching the native languages of the nations of the Russian Federation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scientific support for the preservation, support and development of native</td>
<td>The areas of scientific research of subjects of the Russian Federation relating to the languages of the nations of the Russian Federation in the Russian Foundation for Basic Research projects’ competition 2018 held by the Russian Foundation for Basic Research in conjunction with the subjects of the Russian Federation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>languages</td>
<td>Number of grants for the special contest of the Russian Science Foundation “Scientific research in the field of the Russian language and other languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation” for 2016–2018 Russian Science Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number of grants in the humanities (excluding projects for a special competition in 2016 in the field of the Russian language and other languages of the peoples of Russia) supported by the Russian Science Foundation for 2014-2019.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRESERVATION AND STUDY OF NATIVE LANGUAGES IN THE FIELD OF CULTURE AND ARTS</td>
<td>Number of ethnographic, literary and historical museums that increase the interest of children and youth in national history, culture and languages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preservation and popularization of resources that make up the national and</td>
<td>Volume of documents of a region’s library fund in the languages of the peoples of Russia, except Russian, in % of the total volume of documents.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cultural heritage of the nations of Russia.</td>
<td>Number of national theaters in the subject of the Russian Federation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thematic cluster</td>
<td>Indicator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support for various creative projects that has ethno cultural nature.</td>
<td>Number of grants for creative projects in the field of culture and art aimed at preserving and developing the culture of peoples living in the territory of the Russian Federation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PRESERVATION AND STUDY OF NATIVE LANGUAGES IN MASS MEDIA</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mass media in the languages of the nations of the Russian Federation</td>
<td>Number of registered mass media in the languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regional content of Federal State Unitary Enterprise All-Russian State Television and Radio broadcasting Company on the TV channels “Russia 1” and “Russia 24” and the radio channel “Radio Russia” in national languages</td>
<td>The availability of a regional branch (territorial branch) of All-Russian State Television and Radio broadcasting Company broadcasting in national languages on the channel “Russia 1”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broadcasting volume in national languages on the TV channel “Russia 1” of the regional branch (territorial branch) of the All-Russian State Television and Radio Broadcasting Company, min / week</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The regional language policy assessment model provides for the use of the following methods of collecting, storing, processing and using information:

1. To create an information base, a scheme for collecting information from open Internet sources for 85 subjects of the Russian Federation is applied, followed by the formation of a database. To do this, we use the information of the portals of state bodies (open data of the Ministry of Culture of the Russian Federation, the Ministry of Education of the Russian Federation, Federal Supervision Agency for Information Technologies, Communications and Mass Media), state authorities of the subjects of the Russian Federation (official sites), official Internet portals of legal information, scientific foundations, as well as sites of educational and public organizations.

2. The second stage of data processing is the formation of a 85 x 31 data matrix (85 is the number of subjects of the Russian Federation, 31 is the number of indicators), the rows of which are the subjects of the Russian Federation, and the columns are quantitative indicators and qualitative characteristics, expressed in points.
3. Considering that different indicators have values that differ in absolute value, the third stage of data processing is the standardization of the data matrix, that is, the transformation of the original object-attribute data matrix into a standardized data matrix (Maltseva et al., 2019).

4. The fourth stage of data processing is the calculation of the resulting assessment index for each subject of the Russian Federation (by summing the standardized values of each indicator in rows) for each of the four thematic clusters.

5. The fifth stage of data processing is the ranking of subjects within the corresponding classification group in descending order of the values of the resulting index for each thematic cluster (the subject with the maximum value of the generalizing indicator takes the first place, the subject with the worst value of the generalizing indicator takes the last place).

6. The sixth stage of data processing is to calculate the integral index of the assessment of the authorities’ activities for each subject of the Russian Federation (by summing the values of generalizing indicators in all thematic areas). The subject with the maximum value of the integral indicator takes the first place in the classification group, the subject with the minimum value of the integral indicator takes the last place.

In accordance with the type of language situation prevailing in the region, it is advisable to divide all the subjects of the Russian Federation into 4 groups in order to evaluate the authorities’ activities of the subjects of the Russian Federation in support of the native languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation and to ensure the possibility of receiving education in native language (Figure 1).
Figure 1. The territorial distribution of regions groups in accordance with the type of language situation.
The first group should include the republics of the Russian Federation, because there are the most serious problems of the development of national languages. The republics are the main region where the majority indigenous peoples of Russia live (numbering more than 50,000 people) (Maltseva et al., 2018).

The Unified List of Indigenous Minorities of the Russian Federation, which included 47 peoples, indicating the subjects of the Russian Federation which territories where they live was approved by Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation of March 24, 2000 No. 255. In order to assess the activities of regional authorities of the subjects of the Russian Federation in supporting the native languages of the nations of the Russian Federation and to ensure the possibility of receiving education in native language, it is also advisable to combine such subjects of the Russian Federation into a group.

Other regions are characterized mainly by a single-ethnic population which represented largely by regions of central Russia, which make up a large part of the country's territory. However, an important factor is building relationships with internal diasporas here (Uzbeks, Kyrgyz, Azerbaijanis, Kazakhs, etc.), their several generations live in Russia and are full citizens, as well as migrants from the CIS countries, who also has the right to attention from the state.

Such regions, in turn, were divided into two groups. The first included subjects of the Russian Federation, which the number of pupils in all classes in the native languages of the nations of Russia (except Russian) and studying them as an independent subject is above zero.

Regions where native languages (except Russian) does not taught combined in the fourth group for evaluating the activities of the authorities of the subjects of the Russian Federation in supporting the native languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation.

**Results.**

The aim of the study is to assess the policy of the regional authorities of the subjects of the Russian Federation with a high level of prevalence of national languages and ranking according to the
results of the assessment.

In this regard, the regions where the teaching and learning of the languages of the nations of Russia are not conducted in accordance with the statistics of the Ministry of Education of the Russian Federation were allocated to a separate classification group, and there is no ratings for them. At the same time, it should be noted that native languages in schools must be studied on a compulsory basis wherever it is necessary to preserve the language of the corresponding ethnic group. This should not be only in national republics, autonomous areas, regions where small peoples live, but also in other subjects of the Russian Federation, for example, in settlements where the share of the local ethnic group is a significant part of the population. Zero regional indicators can indicate both the incompleteness of statistical data and an ineffective educational policy relating the preservation and study of the native languages of the peoples of Russia, carried out by regional authorities.

The results of distribution of the subjects of the Russian Federation by the values of the final indices are shown in Figure 2.
Figure 2 - Classification of the subjects of the Russian Federation by the value of the final index characterizing the level of language policy of regional authorities.
Discussion.

The analysis showed that the values of the final index for the regions of the classification group “Republics” are located in a wide range [0.6; 3.1], which is an indicator of significant differences in the effectiveness of policy pursued by regional authorities to support the native languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation and to ensure the possibility of receiving education in native language.

The leader in the rating of this group is the Republic of Tatarstan. It ranks first in three thematic clusters, in the cluster “Preservation and study of native languages in the field of education and science” it took the second position.

The Republic of Bashkortostan, which takes the second place in the ranking, is significantly separated from the leader due to the rather low value of the Education and Science Index.

The Republic of Crimea is the outsider of the rating for a group of republics, which can be explained by its recent entry into the Russian Federation.

The analysis showed that the values of the final index for the regions of the classification group “Regions - the territories of indigenous peoples” are in the range [0.2; 1.8], which is an indicator of not so significant differences in the effectiveness of policy pursued by regional authorities to support the native languages of the nations of the Russian Federation and to ensure the possibility of receiving education in native language.

The leader of the rating of the group “Regions – the territories of indigenous peoples” is the Khanty-Mansiysk Autonomous Area - Ugra. However, unlike the Republic of Tatarstan, it does not consistently occupy the first positions in all thematic clusters, but is among the five leaders in each index. The second place in the ranking is occupied by the Yamalo-Nenets Autonomous Area, it has a slight lag behind the leader in the indexes of three thematic clusters, and ahead of him in the Culture and Art Index.
The outsider of the rating is the Murmansk region. Regional authorities need to pay more attention to supporting the native languages of the nations of Russia in such areas of public life as education and science, culture and art, and the mass media.

In general, it can be noted that the subjects of the Russian Federation, which occupy the last positions in the ranking, are the regions of the North-West of Russia, where indigenous minorities make up a fairly small fraction of the population. Therefore, the policy of the authorities to support the preservation and development of the native languages of the nations of Russia is not so active.

The analysis showed that the values of the final index for the regions of the classification group “Regions where training (study) is conducted in the native languages of the peoples of Russia” are located in a wide range [0.5; 4.8], which is an indicator of significant differences in the effectiveness of policy pursued by regional authorities to support the native languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation and to provide educational opportunities in native language.

The leader in the rating for this group of regions is the Ulyanovsk Region. This is mainly due to the effectiveness of the activities of regional authorities in the implementation of educational policy in support of the preservation and development of the native languages of the nations of Russia.

An outsider is the Amur Region, where there is practically no education in the native languages of the peoples of Russia. The indicators in other thematic clusters is also extremely low. Regions with very low indicators also include the Bryansk region, which resulting index is close in value to the indicators of the Amur Region.

**CONCLUSIONS.**

The results of the study can be used by state authorities of the federal level and the subjects of the Russian Federation conducting state administration in the field of language and educational policy, during adjusting the strategy of language and educational policy for the preservation and development of languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation, including at the level of regulatory support, during making management decisions, including the distribution of funding, etc.
As a result of the study, the most significant indicators were identified that can be used at the regional level to assess the language situation and the subsequent implementation of management mechanisms that contribute to the preservation and development of the native languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation.

Working with the methodology in relation to regions involves the determination of benchmark regions, the development of measures to improve the language policy in terms of increasing indicators.

The assessment of the activities of regional authorities of the subjects of the Russian Federation with a high level of prevalence of national languages to support the native languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation and to ensure the possibility of receiving education in native language was made in a pilot mode, since the incompleteness of the statistics presented in the public domain on the Internet does not allow to consider the rating results the absolutely reliable.

Methodological approaches to the construction of this rating need further clarification in relation of the allocation of specific weights that determine the significance of individual indicators. This can be solved using expert assessments, questioning methods of regional authorities, in the framework of public discussion.

Acknowledgement.

The article was completed under the State contract without number from 06.05.2019 for the provision of expert and analysis studies on the topic “Improving the legislative support for language and educational policies in support of the preservation and study of the native languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation (federal and regional aspects)”.

BIBLIOGRAPHIC REFERENCES.


DATA OF THE AUTHORS.

1. Anna Maltseva. Candidate of Economic Sciences, Associate professor, Director of Lurye Scientific and Methodological Center for Higher School Innovative Activity, Tver State University, Tver, Russian Federation.


3. Elena Klyushnikova. Senior researcher in Lurye Scientific and Methodological Center for Higher School Innovative Activity of Tver State University, Tver, Russian Federation.

4. Marina Krekova. Doctor of Economic Sciences, Professor, Department “Personnel management”, Moscow Polytechnic University, Moscow, Russian Federation.

5. Olga Danilina. Candidate of Economic Sciences, Associate professor, Department of Information Systems, State University of Management, Moscow, Russian Federation.
6. **Olga Azoeva.** Candidate of Economic Sciences, Associate professor, Department of Economic policy and economic dimensions, State University of Management, Moscow, Russian Federation.

**RECIBIDO:** 4 de diciembre del 2019.  

**APROBADO:** 14 de diciembre del 2019.